COMPARISON OF INSTAGRAM INSIGHT WITH AND WITHOUT INSTAGRAM ADS AND INSTAGRAM STORIES ADS CASE STUDY OF VINTAGE HOUSE INDONESIA

SASKIA NANDINA APRILIA

School of Business and Management, Bandung Institute of Technology, Bandung, Indonesia
E-mail: saskia.nandina@sbm-itb.ac.id

Abstract - Instagram have been commonly used by marketers as nowadays as social medias are used as the first and foremost branding channel. The growing number of business owners in Instagram have resulted Instagram to create Instagram for Business and features to support businesses to create paid advertisements in Instagram called Instagram Ads and Instagram Stories Ads. Not only features, Instagram also create a policy in order to reduce missed posts called Instagram algorithm. As a business that is operating mainly in Instagram, Vintage House Indonesia was impacted by Instagram algorithm, likes as one of Instagram Insight attribute got drained after Instagram algorithm was applied on 2016. Therefore, an experimental research is done in purpose to determine the comparison of Instagram Insight with and without Instagram Ads and Instagram Stories Ads. This research is also intended to acknowledge which period gained the highest positive comment and which content type that gained the highest Instagram Insight from the three periods. The subject of the study is Vintage House Indonesia, an Instagram-based fashion online shop. The experimental research type is quasi experiment with pre-test and post-test research design. The input of the experiment is the advertising content, advertising cost and the advertising time that will be explained in the paper. The result are insight data from each Instagram post during the period when Vintage House Indonesia is using Instagram ads and Instagram Stories Ads, when Vintage House Indonesia is not using any Instagram Ads and when Vintage House Indonesia is using Instagram ads and Instagram Stories Ads. The Insight data is collected from Vintage House Indonesia's Instagram analytics from each post posted, the data of the three periods will then be compared using simple matrix and Kruskal and Wallis test. The findings are: 1) Comparing the insight data, the first period using Instagram Ads and Instagram Stories Ads from Instagram gained the highest mean in all Instagram Insight (Interaction, Follows, Reach, Like, Comment, Share, and Save). By doing Kruskal Wallis test, it is concluded that there's a significant difference in all Instagram Insight result between the three periods except for comment. But the last period which repeated using Instagram Ads and Instagram Story Ads from Facebook with "Brand awareness" objective and targeting custom audience did get the lowest Instagram Insight result than the period that is not using ads and when using ads, 2) Comparing the content analysis result, the period without Instagram Ads and Instagram Stories Ads gain the highest positive comment, 3) Comparing the content analysis from the periods, to gain the highest interaction, follows and save the content type recommended is flat lay. To gain the highest reach and like the content type recommended are; Flat lay, on model with no face, on model with face and graphic. To gain the highest comment, the on model with face content type is recommended. Meanwhile to get the highest save, the content type recommended is on model with no face.

Keywords - Comparison, Instagram Ads, Instagram Insight, Instagram Stories Ads.

I. INTRODUCTION

In this digital era, Internet usage continues to explode across the world with digital becoming an increasingly important source of competitive advantage in both B2C and B2B marketing [1]. The Internet has become one of the most important marketplaces for transactions of goods and services. For example, online consumer spending in the United States surpassed USD 100 billion (already in 2007), and the growth rates of online demands for information goods, such as books, magazines, and software, are between 25% and 50% [2].

According to BBC News [3], 1,123 stores disappeared from Britain's top 500 high streets in the first six months of the year, according to the accountancy firm PwC. In average, about 14 shops are closing everyday as UK High streets face their toughest trading climate in five years. Meanwhile in Indonesia, several big retailing companies are also closing such as MAP Group (Debenhams, Lotus) and PT Matahari Department Store, shifting shopping behavior is said as the cause, either shopping from independent online shops or from e-commerce. This behavior shifted due to benefits offered by online shopping. People feel uncomfortable and time consuming for going to crowded markets so online shopping is a boon since it saves a lot of time [4]. Moreover, another research found that perceived ease of use and perceived enjoyment are the factors that affect online shopping intention [5].

In this online shopping behavior era, Marketers are using social media as a branding channel first and foremost [6]. A significant 87% of all marketers indicated that their social media efforts have generated more exposure for their businesses. Increased traffic was the second major benefit, with 78% reporting positive results. These top two benefits have remained virtually unchanged for 4 years [7]. Instagram is one of the most popular social media who gave the biggest

impact to business. In Instagram, fashion industries gain the highest engagement than Facebook and twitter, Instagram gained 0.917%, Facebook 0.099% and twitter 0.035% [8]. With the growing number of business owners in Instagram, On November 2013 Instagram launched Instagram Ads feature for their business users to advertise their business in Instagram. Not only features, to satisfy their users that keeps on increasing, Instagram create a policy in order to reduce missed posts called Instagram algorithm. With Instagram algorithm, posts appearing in user's feeds are no longer in chronological order, but based on the best-ranked posts; the ones that are determined to be the most relevant or the most interesting one for a user. Along with the likelihood of a user towards a post, engagement with the post, post timeliness, user's relationship with the account posting are also highlighted to be the factors affecting the rank of a post to appear in user's feeds [9]. As a business that is operating mainly in Instagram, Vintage House Indonesia was impacted by Instagram algorithm, likes, one of Instagram Insight attribute, got drained after Instagram algorithm was applied. Therefore, an experimental research is done in purpose to determine the comparison of Instagram Insight with and without Instagram Ads and Instagram Stories Ads in Vintage House Indonesia. In conclusion, this study is aimed to acknowledge B2C businesses (preferably SMEs or Small Medium Enterprise) about the comparison of Instagram Insight with and without Instagram and Instagram Stories Ads.

The place the study is conducted only in Instagram social media of Vintage House Indonesia. The first limitation is that the content posted is different due to the product availability of Vintage House Indonesia. The other limitation is that researcher couldn't exactly make sure the exact people who is targeted as the audience of Instagram ads and Instagram stories ads, because the target audience is controlled by Instagram logarithm along with the database Instagram have regarding their users. The limitation of this study is also the existence of extraneous variable that are not studied in this research but might affect the experiment such as the timing of posting, the Instagram logarithm, the content semiotics and other affecting factors.

II. CONCEPTUAL FRAMEWORK

A. Social Media Marketing

Social media marketing means promoting or doing a business's marketing activities using social media channels. Now days, social media plays a huge role in digital marketing, almost every existing business now have social media account to help their business grow in many ways. Big brands make use of the social media to convey their strong existence and friendly customer relationship (Saravanakumar, 2012). Social media marketing is done by businesses by sharing contents, every content posted in any social media can be seen by million users, not only the users that are updated or following the business's social media accounts, but also by other users that might be affected by social media policies. Social media tends to give greater exposure to posts that have biggest responds whether likes or comments, like in Instagram, the post with a lot of likes and comments can appear in explore, and in You tube, it will appear in home. Therefore, existing in social medias can also help businesses to be reached by other users that are previously not following them by creating quality contents, in other word, social media also helps businesses to gain more awareness. Social media also gives another benefit to businesses, it allows business users to customize the content they are posting. Either content for introducing new products, for informing promotions, or other purpose, social media very favorable for businesses because businesses can freely create content based on their needs.

B. Instagram for Business

Instagram, the world's largest and most influential photo sharing service, was created in 2010, acquired by Facebook in 2012, and claims more than 500 million monthly active users who have helped contribute more than 30 billion images using Apple iPhone or Android smartphones as of 2016 (Carroll, 2017). Created by Kevin Systrom and Michel Krieger, their main feature was the photo sharing feature, however with the growing number for business owners, Instagram created Instagram for Business The differences of this Instagram business account rather than the usual account is they have are allowed to do paid advertising such as Instagram Ads and Instagram Stories Ads and also see their Instagram Analytics that will further be explained below.

C. Instagram Ads and Instagram Stories Ads

Instagram ads and Instagram stories ads are paid business features in Instagram, the difference is basically the place where the ads in placed. Instagram ads appeared earlier and it allows business users to create contents that can appear in Instagram user's feeds who aren't actually following the business's Instagram account. It can be in many forms such as single photo, 60 seconds single video, group of photos and videos that can be swiped (carousel ads) and collection of photos (collection adverts) and it appears in the middle-part of the screen where the common post appear. The actions that can be done by audience from Instagram ads is like, comment and click the advertiser's profile, just like common Instagram posts. For Instagram ads, Instagram also provide shortcut button for audience to be sent to; to advertiser's profile, to advertiser's website, and to advertiser's shop front. Meanwhile Instagram stories ads appeared later after the Instagram stories appeared in August 2016. Instagram stories ads allows businesses to have

their contents be seen in full-screen, vertical format, in photo or video form, Instagram stories is also placed on top of the screen, different with common Instagram posts, allows it to get different attention from Instagram users. Both Instagram ads and Instagram stories can be published from Instagram or Facebook Ads Manager, the steps are commonly the same; set the ad objective, target audience, advertising time and budget. Facebook Ads Manager offers larger variety of ads objective and larger customization in creating target audience, however the ads activated from Facebook must also be activated in Facebook. After the ads have ran out of publishing time, business owners can see the response of the ads in form of amount of likes, comments, people who saved the picture, clicks, amount of people who visit the profile, amount of people who visit the website, amount of people who clicked "Get Directions" button, amount of people who clicked "Email" button, amount of people who seen the ad (reach), impression from the ads and number of follows from the ads, or other attributes regarding their advertising objective.

D. Instagram Analytics

Instagram analytics allows business users to get more detailed information about the traffic of their account. When an account clicked "settings", there will be an option called "insights". In this insight section the business owners can see the traffic of their account that is divided into three sections; activity, content and audience. In the activity section, Instagram provide traffic data of the business owner's account. Business users can know the number of weekly interaction, daily interaction, weekly profile visit, weekly website clicks, email clicks, weekly get direction clicks and the number of account reached. In the content section, the user can see the performance of contents posted whether it's a feed post or Instagram stories post in a particular week. The content section will show every content posted, the amount of users seen the post and the comparison of number of posts posted between the week and the week before. After each content is clicked, the business owners can see the insight of each content that consists of number of likes, comments, saved, shared, profile visits from the post and also account reached. In the audience section, Instagram provide statistic information of an Instagram account's audience such as number of followers, comparison of number of followers in the particular week and a week before, location of followers, age range of followers, gender of followers, and also active hours of followers and active days of followers.

E. Instagram Insight

Instagram Insight are the data provided by Instagram analytics regarding the traffic of our Instagram account. Instagram insight attributes will be explained on Table 1.

Attribute Name	Definition
Interaction	The number of actions taken from this post which includes profile visits, website clicks and email clicks
Reach	The number of unique account that have seen your post. Reach is different from impressions, which may include multiple views of your ads by the same people
Follow	The number of accounts that started following you
Like	The number of likes in your post
Comment	The number of comments dropped in your post
Share	The number of time people shared your post
Save	The number of time people saved your post

Table 0.1. Instagram Insight Attribute

III. METHODOLOGY

For the study, researcher is using experimental research; quasi-experimental type of experimental research with pre-test and post-test research design. There's no control group for the experiment, only one group is used in this experiment; Instagram of Vintage House Indonesia. The experiment is testing three periods; the period when the period when Vintage House Indonesia is using Instagram Ads and Instagram Stories Ads, the period when Vintage House Indonesia is not using any ads and the period when Vintage House Indonesia is using Instagram Ads and Instagram Stories Ads. The data collected is the Instagram Insight from each post during the period, thus the study is expected to determine the comparison of Instagram insight with and without Instagram Ads and Instagram Stories ads in Vintage House Indonesia. The experiments are done with the condition as shown on Table 2 and Table 3 below:

Ad Publisher	Advertising features used	Amount of days	Start date	End date	Budget (in Rupiahs)
Instagram	Instagram ads & Instagram stories ads	9	27 January 2019	4 February 2019	300.000
-	None	30	17 February 2019	31 March 2019	-
Facebook Ads Manager	Instagram ads & Instagram stories ads	30	1 April 2019	30 April 2019	1.000.000

Table 2. Experiment Condition

Objective	Target audience	Result
Website visit (@Vintagehouse.catalog)	Automatic	Instagram Insight data
-	Followers of Vintage House Indonesia	Instagram Insight data
Brand awareness of @vintagehouse_id	"Lebaran" customized audience	Instagram Insight data

Table 3. Experiment Condition

The "automatic" audience chosen means that Instagram will be targeting people that is similar to your Instagram followers, it looks for those who have engaged with your content before and may be interested in seeing more. Meanwhile the "Lebaran" customized audience refers to the manual audience created based on Vintage House Indonesia's historical buyers with the characteristics: female, aged 17-25 years old, living in Indonesia, having interest in outerwear, cardigan (sweater), cable knitting, sweater, nude (art), pastel (color) or woman's clothing. For the "Lebaran" target audience, the ads is also scheduled to be shown on Monday to Thursday 3 to 9 PM, Friday 12 to 9 PM, Saturday and Sunday at 9 AM to 9 PM, the scheduling is arranged based on Vintage House Indonesia follower's active hours. After collecting the data researcher compare the insight data from the three periods. including the insight data regarding the content types that will be explained in Table 4 below:

Content Type	Definition
Flat Lay	Product captured in flat surface, containing only key objects arranged in a well-thought composition, commonly captured perpendicular from the surface
Catalog	9 product photos displayed in 3x3 grid
Series in Hanger	Products with the same model but different color placed in hanger
On model with face	Product worn by model with the face of model can be seen
On model with no Face	Product worn by model with the face of model cannot be seen
Graphic	Graphical content in purpose to inform audience
Others	Content that is not included to the other categories and only used to make the feeds aesthetic

Table 4. Content Types

IV. FINDINGS

A. Instagram Insight Comparison

Variables	Group		
	Ads IG	No Ads	Ads from FB
Interaction			
X (SD)	3253,2 (8076,0)	158,1 (119,6)	63,9 (98,5)
Minimum	242,4	39,0	4,2
Maximum	24775,8	570,0	433,7
Follows			
X (SD)	182,2 (517,0)	2,1 (2,8)	0,4 (0,7)
Minimum	0,0	0,0	0,0
Maximum	1560,0	10,0	3,3
Reach			
X (SD)	55859,3 (126.583,4)	3805,3 (1808,3)	868,2 (484,3)
Minimum	7415,2	1990,0	212,2
Maximum	393172,7	8719,0	2133,3
Like			
X (SD)	1153,9 (2524,7)	98,5 (62,3)	27,3 (20,7)
Minimum	139,4	33,0	7,0
Maximum	7878,8	281,0	105,2

Comment			
X (SD)	3,4 (4,7)	1,1 (1,7)	0,3 (0,7)
Minimum	0,0	0,0	0,0
Maximum	12,1	8,0	2,6
Share			
X (SD)	8,1 (5,9)	2,3 (2,3)	0,6 (0,9)
Minimum	0,0	0,0	0,0
Maximum	15,2	10,0	3,3
Save			
X (SD)	241,4 (332,6)	29,9 (22,7)	7 (8,5)
Minimum	69,7	0,0	0,0
Maximum	1109,1	98,0	26,7

Table 5. Instagram Insight Comparison

The data compared have been standardized by dividing each period data with each period's amount of days and budget. Comparing the 3 periods, from Table 4.20, the Instagram insight (interaction, follows, reach, like, comment, share and save) gain different result, however, the period using Instagram Ads and Instagram Story Ads from Instagram gain the highest mean in all Instagram Insight compared with the period without Ads and period with using Instagram Ads and Instagram Story Ads from Facebook.

Researcher then do a test to get the statistical conclusion whether the 3 periods are having a significant change or not having a significant change, before determining the test, normality test and homogeneity test is done and the result is shown on Table 6 below:

Variables	Normality test*		Homogeneity test**	
	p-value	Description	p-value	Description
Interaction				
Ads IG	0,000	Abnormal	0,000	Not Homogeneous
No Ads	0,002	Abnormal		
Ads FB	0,000	Abnormal		
Follows				
Ads IG	0,000	Abnormal	0,000	Not Homogeneous
No Ads	0,000	Abnormal		
Ads FB	0,000	Abnormal		
Reach				
Ads IG	0,000	Abnormal	0,000	Not Homogeneous
No Ads	0,001	Abnormal		
Ads FB	0,184	Normal		
Like				
Ads IG	0,000	Abnormal	0,000	Not Homogeneous
No Ads	0,009	Abnormal		
Ads FB	0,002	Abnormal		
Comment				
Ads IG	0,008	Abnormal	0,000	Not Homogeneous
No Ads	0,000	Abnormal		
Ads FB	0,000	Abnormal		
Share				
Ads IG	0,013	Abnormal	0,000	Not Homogeneous

No Ads	0,001	Abnormal		
Ads FB	0,000	Abnormal		
Save				
Ads IG	0,001	Abnormal	0,000	Not Homogeneous
No Ads	0,090	Normal		
Ads FB	0,002	Abnormal		

Table 6. Normality and Homogeneity Test

Data is stated to have normal distribution and as homogeneous data when the p-value is higher than 0,05 (α=5%). Table 4.21 shown that almost all the data in the 3 condition is not having normal distribution and not homogeneous, therefore Kruskal Wallis test is chosen to know if there's a significant change or not. The result of the Kruskal Wallis test is shown on Table 7 below:

Variables	P-Value
Interaction	0,000
Follows	0,000
Reach	0,000
Like	0,000
Comment	0,056
Share	0,000
Save	0,000

Table 7. Kruskal and Wallis Test

The hypothesis is accepted if the p-value amount is less than 0.05. According to the Kruskal Wallis testing as shown on Table 7, all the Instagram Insight are having significant difference between the three periods because (p=0,000 < 0,0500). However, there's one Instagram Insight, comment, that gained p-value higher than 0.05 therefore all Instagram Insight except comment are having significant difference between the period using Instagram Ads from Instagram, the period without using Ads and the period using Instagram Ads and Instagram Stories Ads from Facebook.

B. Instagram Insight Content Analysis Comparison

For this analysis, researcher is dividing the First period with Instagram Ads and Instagram Stories Ads from Instagram into two; with the promoted post included and without the promoted post included because the promoted post on the first period gain significant higher Instagram insight than the other contents posted during the period. According to the comparation, the highest interaction, follows and save is gained by the flat lay content type. The highest reach and like are gained by the content type Flat lay, on model with no face, on model with face and graphic content type. Meanwhile the highest comment is gained by the on model with face content type and the highest save is gained by the on model with no face content type.

C. Instagram Insight Comment Analysis Comparison

Period	Positive comment
With Instagram Ads and Instagram Stories Ads	0,37037037
Without Instagram Ads and Instagram Stories Ads	0,9
With Instagram Ads and Instagram Stories Ads	0,059259259

Table 8. Positive Comment Table

From the result, the period without Instagram Ads and Instagram Stories Ads gain the highest positive comment (average 0,9 comment). The first period with Instagram Ads and Instagram Stories Ads gain the second highest positive comment (average 0,37037037 comment) and the second period with Instagram Ads and Instagram Stories Ads from Facebook gain the lowest positive comment (average 0,0592593 comment).

V. CONCLUSION

The research objective is to help online B2C SME that is Instagram-based to acknowledge the comparison of Instagram Insight with and without Instagram Ads and Instagram Stories Ads. This research is also intended to acknowledge which period gained the highest positive comment and which content type that gained the highest Instagram Insight from the three periods. After conducting the experiment, researcher concluded several conclusions:

1. Comparing the insight data, the first period using Instagram Ads and Instagram Stories Ads from Instagram gained the highest mean in all Instagram Insight (Interaction, Follows, Reach, Like, Comment, Share, and Save). By doing Kruskal Wallis test, it is concluded that there's a significant difference in all Instagram Insight result between the three periods except for comment. But the last period which repeated using Instagram Ads and Instagram Story Ads from Facebook with "Brand awareness" objective and targeting custom audience did get the lowest Instagram Insight result than the period that is not using ads and when using ads

2. Comparing the content analysis result, the period without Instagram Ads and Instagram Stories Ads gain the highest positive comment.
3. Comparing the content analysis from the periods, to gain the highest interaction, follows and save the content type recommended is flat lay. To gain the highest reach and like the content type recommended are; Flat lay, on model with no face, on model with face and graphic. To gain the highest comment, the on model with face content type is recommended. Meanwhile to get the highest save, the content type recommended is on model with no face.

It is concluded that social media advertising, in this case Instagram Ads and Instagram Stories ads from Instagram might create higher Instagram insight. However, if brand owners are aiming for brand engagement in form of positive comments, Instagram Ads and Instagram Ads is unnecessary. In posting the content in social media, there are also some content types that is suitable for each Instagram Insight variables.

REFERENCES

[1] Leeflang, P. S., Verhoef, P. C., Dahlström, P. & Freundt, T., 2014. Challenges and solutions for marketing in a digital era. European Management Journal 32, p. 12.

[2] Albuquerque, P. et al., 2012. Evaluating Promotional Activities in an Online Two-Sided Market of User-Generated Content. 31(3).

[3] BBC News, 2018. Retailers shut 2,700 shops in first half of the year. [Online]
Available at: https://www.bbc.com/news/business-46142025

[4] Sunitha, C. K. & Gnanadhas, E., 2014. Online Shopping - An Overview.

[5] Cheema, U. et al., n.d. THE TREND OF ONLINE SHOPPING IN 21ST CENTURY: IMPACT OF. Asian Journal of Empirical Research 3(2).

[6] eMarketer, 2013. Advertisers boost social ad budgets in 2013. [Online]
Available at: http://www.emarketer.com/Article/Advertisers-Boost-Social-Ad-Budgets-2013/1009688

[7] Stelzner, M. A., 2018. 2018 Social Media Marketing Industry Report, s.l.: Social Media Examiner.

[8] Feehan, B., 2018. 2018 Social Media Industry Benchmark Report, Seattle: Rival IQ.

[9] Pollock, S., 2018. Instagram Algorithm Change Histories. [Online]
Available at: https://powerdigitalmarketing.com/blog/instagram-algorithm-change-histories/
[Accessed 28 June 2019].

★★★